



Legislative Council – January 25th, 2017

REPORT OF THE ACCOUNTABILITY COMMITTEE TO THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

Convened on Jan. 15th and Jan. 22nd 2018

Co-chairs: Speaker Nikolas Dolmat and Parliamentarian Christelle Tessono

Membership: Director Isabelle Anderson, Director Alex Scheffel, Director Sophie Schaffer-Wood, and members-at-large Matthew McLaughlin, Alison Schwenk, Maeve Botham, and Kokulan Mahendiran.

1. Purpose

The Accountability Committee is a committee of the Board of Directors of the Students' Society of McGill University. With regards to the Committee Terms of Reference:

"The Accountability Committee shall hold Officers, Senators, Directors and Councillors accountable to their obligations and responsibilities under the Constitution, Internal Regulations, Policies (except where adherence to a policy is already supervised and administered by a Committee of the Legislative Council or the Board of Directors), and formal mandates."¹ (Committee Terms of Reference 2016-09-15)

2. Discussion on future evaluations: creating an institutionalized framework

Performance Evaluation Framework

Going forward the Accountability Committee, a committee of the Board of Directors, will begin the draft creation of future standardized performance evaluation framework for Senators, Councillors, Officers and Directors. This process will also include consultation portions with members of the respective bodies. A standardized framework creates the benefit of solidifying positional expectations of our student representatives and would further smooth the transitional process of newly elected/appointed student officials. This framework would be transmitted to and explained to these student representatives at the beginning of their terms allowing them to understand the basis for which their performance will be evaluated on.

¹ <https://ssmu.ca/wp-content/uploads/2008/10/Committee-Terms-of-Reference-Book-2016-09-15.pdf?x26516>



For Legislative Council, building off the criteria used within this report of their attendance rates in several circumstances as well as the submission timeline of their reports. There is the possibility of considering the substantiveness of a report or the adherence of one to proposed guidelines. Another avenue could be evaluated with regards to exceptional circumstances of severe unbecoming decorum of a Councillor. A future section explaining or tabulating any suspensions from Legislative Council if they so arise.

For the future framework to be constructed with regards to the Members-at-large of the Board of Directors, the term beginning and end in addition to the duration must be considered, given that, the terms begin and end in November. If evaluated, for the fall semester, the outgoing Directors will no longer be on the Board of Directors and the new ones will have been in this position since November. Therefore, it may not be as detailed.

With regards to Senators, a standardized framework for the evaluation of Senators without seats on Legislative Council will be considered. These individuals are less seen in the eyes of the student body, yet their work on their respective committees is valuable to the representation of the student body. The possibility of showcasing attendance rates, committee membership and roles are possible for this future framework.

With regards to the Officers of the Society, they provide the most diverse set of factors as an Officer may be involved with the Senate and the Board of Directors in addition to sitting on Legislative Council and their respective Society Duties. For Officers, the framework should consider a possible benchmark and criteria that expands depending on the body memberships of the Officer in question. Furthermore, it will be difficult to quantify and actualize the substantiveness of every aspect of an Officers position.

There are other aspects the Committee may consider when undergoing this standardized evaluation process:

1. Explanation and transmission of expectations;
2. Decorum and respectful behavior as an indicator;
3. Increase accessibility of this committee's reports;
4. Ensure submission of relevant Legislative Council documents to the Society's website;
5. Expansion of committee to include various stakeholders, such as: clubs and services, equity commissioners;
6. Guiding framework to promote understanding of the Committee's purpose;



7. Ensuring the committee fosters maximum legitimacy and avoiding overstepping of bounds in order to do so;
8. Possibility of consideration of peer evaluations in holistic manner; and
9. Creation of a self-evaluation platform for student representatives;

Future Undertakings of the Committee:

Open door/whistle blower policy

The possibility of the draft creation of a whistleblower policy or point of first contact for those wishing to express discontent within an operation within the Society. A draft policy that may or may not include a process involving the committee, in which the committee would collaborate and consult with others in the Society to construct.

Reforming Committee Terms of Reference

As an effort to institutionalize the processes that the committee wishes to undertake, substantive changes will need to be implemented in the committee terms of reference. This means that future collaboration between councillors at the Legislative Council and the committee will be anticipated and highly encouraged.

3. Performance Evaluation Explanations

For the Fall 2017 performance evaluations of Officers, Senators, Directors and Councillors, the committee did not have any institutionalized criteria of evaluation or significant expectations transmitted to it. Therefore, this report will focus on the objective criteria which will not require subjective interpretation, namely:

- i. Attendance records, of which a student representative will be in attendance, confirmed a proxy in their stead, absent which is excused, and an unexcused absence.
- ii. Councillor/Officer reports and their proper submission within the expected submission deadline.
- iii. Exceptional circumstances if they should arise.



Performance Evaluations

- **Legislative Council (Strictly Councillors)**

Arts Corinne Bulger

Attendance: 7

Proxy: 1

Excused: 0

Unexcused: 0

Perfect attendance and reports submitted in a timely manner.

Arts Jennifer Chan

Attendance: 7

Proxy: 1

Excused: 0

Unexcused: 0

Perfect attendance and reports submitted in a timely manner.

Arts Kevin Zhou

Attendance: 8

Proxy: 0

Excused: 0

Unexcused: 0

Perfect attendance and reports submitted in a timely manner.

Arts (VP External) Alice Yue

Attendance: 6

Proxy: 2

Excused: 0

Unexcused: 0

Consistent attendance and reports submitted in a timely manner.



Arts & Science

R'Ay Fodor

Attendance: 6

Proxy: 1

Excused: 0

Unexcused: 1

Consistent attendance with one unexcused absence. Reports submitted in a timely manner.

Athletics

Yué Jiao

Attendance: 7

Proxy: 0

Excused: 0

Unexcused: 1

Consistent attendance with one unexcused absence. Most reports were submitted in a timely manner, though some were missing at the end of the semester.

Clubs

Buland Junejo

Attendance: 3

Proxy: 1

Excused: 0

Unexcused: 1

Term started quite late in the semester which explains the limited attendance. Reports were not always submitted or even on time.

Clubs

Aayzed Tanweer

Attendance: 3

Proxy: 0

Excused: 0

Unexcused: 2



Term started quite late in the semester which explains the limited attendance. However, the failure to provide justifications for the absences is noteworthy. Additionally, no reports were submitted.

Dentistry Nishath Syed

Attendance: 6
Proxy: 0
Excused: 1
Unexcused: 1

Consistent attendance with one unexcused absence. Reports submitted in a timely manner.

Education Josephine Wright O'Manique

Attendance: 5
Proxy: 0
Excused: 0
Unexcused: 2

Attendance has not been consistent. Most reports were submitted in a timely manner.

Engineering Vivian Campbell

Attendance: 8
Proxy: 0
Excused: 0
Unexcused: 0

Perfect attendance. Most reports were submitted, however, when submitted it was in a timely manner.

Engineering Namrata Khopkar

Attendance: 7
Proxy: 0
Excused: 0
Unexcused: 1



Consistent attendance with one unexcused absence. Not all reports were submitted, but when they were it was on a timely manner.

Environment Jamal Tarrabain

Attendance: 7
Proxy: 1
Excused: 0
Unexcused: 0

Consistent attendance. Most reports were submitted in a timely manner.

FYC Anthony Koch

Attendance: 4
Proxy: 0
Excused: 0
Unexcused: 0

Term started quite late in the semester, which explains the limited attendance. No reports were submitted, however.

Law Melisa Demir

Attendance: 7
Proxy: 1
Excused: 0
Unexcused: 0

Perfect attendance and reports submitted in a timely manner.

Management Denzel Mutoko

Attendance: 1
Proxy: 1
Excused: 4
Unexcused: 2

Attendance has not been consistent, and no reports were submitted.



Management

Roderick Madeira-Mackinnon

Attendance: 5

Proxy: 3

Excused: 0

Unexcused: 1

Inconsistent attendance and reports were not always submitted.

Medicine

Andre Lametti

Attendance: 8

Proxy: 0

Excused: 0

Unexcused: 0

Perfect attendance and reports submitted in a timely manner.

Music

Will Thain

Attendance: 2

Proxy: 2

Excused: 0

Unexcused: 0

Term started late, however, the attendance is not consistent. Also, no reports were submitted.

Nursing

Caitlin Bazylykut

Attendance: 5

Proxy: 1

Excused: 1

Unexcused: 1

Consistent attendance with one unexcused absence. Reports were not consistently submitted.



PT/OT Danny Dinh

Attendance: 5
Proxy: 0
Excused: 1
Unexcused: 1

Consistent attendance with one unexcused absence. Reports always submitted in a timely manner.

Residences Thomas Demoulin

Attendance: 4
Proxy: 0
Excused: 0
Unexcused: 0

Perfect attendance and reports submitted in a timely manner. One session without record on 2 Nov 17.

Science Yazan Abu Yousef

Attendance: 6
Proxy: 1
Excused: 0
Unexcused: 0

Perfect attendance and reports were always submitted in a timely manner.

Science Mana Moshkforoush

Attendance: 5
Proxy: 2
Excused: 0
Unexcused: 0

Consistent attendance and reports usually submitted in a timely manner. One session without record on 2 Nov 17.



Science

Marjan Ghazi

Attendance: 6

Proxy: 1

Excused: 0

Unexcused: 0

Perfect attendance and reports were always submitted in a timely manner.

Services

Sonya Bharadwa

Attendance: 2

Proxy: 0

Excused: 0

Unexcused: 2

Although the term started late, attendance has not been consistent and reports were not always submitted in a timely manner.

Social Work Matthew Savage

Attendance: 6

Proxy: 0

Excused: 1

Unexcused: 0

Consistent attendance, however, not all reports were submitted in a timely manner.

- **Senate - Senators of Legislative Council:**

Out of the student senators that represent the undergraduate student body two of them sit on Legislative Council. Their performance evaluations will be based on their activity in relation to Legislative Council. The remaining senators will not receive a performance evaluations due to the inconsistent activities they engage in and the various committees they are members of, which, if evaluated would require a framework to do so with regards to their committees that does not currently exist. Senator Anderson and Senator Mansdoerfer sit on Legislative Council.



Senate Caucus Isabella Anderson

Attendance: 5
Proxy: 2
Excused: 0
Unexcused: 1

Consistent attendance with one unexcused absence. Reports submitted in a timely manner.

Senate Caucus Tre Mansdoerfer

Attendance: 5
Proxy: 1
Excused: 1
Unexcused: 0

Consistent attendance. Reports have not been submitted in a timely manner.

- **Board of Directors**

Tracking the performance of the Board of Directors is very hard as they do not have to submit reports and their attendance has not been consistently tracked.

Member-at-large – Jonathan Glustein

Member-at-large – Simon Shubbar

Member-at-large – Ellen Chen

Member-at-large – Isabella Anderson

Member-at-large – Noah Lew

Member-at-large – Alexander Scheffel

Member-at-large – Sophie Schaffer-Wood

Member-at-large – Dany Morcos

- **Officers**

President Muna Tojiboeva

Attendance: 8
Proxy:
Excused:
Unexcused:

Perfect attendance. Although all reports were submitted, they were often late.



VP External Connor Spencer

Attendance: 8

Proxy:

Excused:

Unexcused:

Perfect attendance and reports submitted in a timely manner.

VP Internal Maya Koparkar

Attendance: 6

Proxy:

Excused: 1

Unexcused:

Consistent attendance and reports submitted in a timely manner.

VP Student Life Jemark Earle

Attendance: 7

Proxy:

Excused: 1

Unexcused:

Consistent attendance and reports submitted in a timely manner.

VP University Affairs Isabelle Oke

Attendance: 7

Proxy:

Excused: 1

Unexcused:

Consistent attendance and reports submitted in a timely manner.